

II.D.3

Absolutism and Enlightenment

Jacobites versus Enlightenment – Twist in history or wellspring of modernity

Dr. Bernd Klewitz



© Pompeo Batoni: General William Gordon, public domain

In dieser Unterrichtsreihe befassen sich Ihre Lernenden mit den historisch gewachsenen Unabhängigkeitsbestrebungen Schottlands. Was steckt hinter der vorgeblichen Romantisierung der *Jacobite Rebellion*, der Niederbetonung von Highland-Ikonen und schottischen Identifikationsmerkmalen?

KOMPETENZEN

Klassensstufe: 11-13

Dauer: 8 Doppelstunden + Klausurvorschlag

Kompetenzen: 1. Leseverstehen: Texte verstehen; 2. Hörsehverstehen: Videos und Bildmaterial verstehen, einordnen, analysieren; 3. Mündliche Kompetenzen: Unterrichtsgespräche führen und Präsentationen geben; 4. Schreibkompetenz: Aufgaben bearbeiten und Texte erstellen

Thematische Bereiche: Staat und Gesellschaft in Westeuropa, *Jacobite Rebellion*, *Scottish Enlightenment*, Brexit und Verfassungsgeschichte

Medien: Texte, Bilder, Videos, TED-Talk, Dokumente

Zusatzmaterialien: Portfolio für das Stationenlernen

Auf einen Blick

1./2. Stunde (T 1)

Thema:	Who were the Jacobites?
M 1	The National Anthem of Scotland
M 2	Historical background

3./4. Stunde (T 2)

Thema:	Why the Jacobites failed
M 3	Culloden Moor and the aftermath

5./6. Stunde (T 3)

Thema:	What the Jacobites set in motion
ZM 1	Jacobites timeline
M 4	The Prince & Flora MacDonald
M 5	Touring the Highlands

7./8. Stunde (T 4)

Thema:	Jacobites remembered in novels, poetry and song
M 6	Jacobites remembered in novels, poetry and song
ZM 2	Sir Walter Scott
ZM 3	Robert Burns
ZM 4	James MacGillivray
ZM 5	James Robertson

9./10. Stunde (T 5)

Thema:	Romantic visions of Scotland
M 7	The massacre of Glencoe
M 8	Wild and majestic

11./12. Stunde (T 6)

Thema: The Scottish Enlightenment

M 9 The Scottish Enlightenment

M 10 The Innocent Railway

13./14. Stunde (T 7)

Thema: Brexit – Myths and reality

M 11 A Scottish House of Lords

M 12 Devolution vs Brexit: a clever decision?

M 13 The pros and cons

M 14 Counting the impact

15./16. Stunde (T 8)

Thema: Klausurvorschlag

M 15 **Essay writing:** Jacobitism as a catalyst for change

M 16 Vocabulary list

The class structures of feudal societies

Based on clear distinctions, this strictly hierarchical order was precisely defined by the law. Feudal aristocrats enjoyed hereditary rights, but they would lose this status unless they were appointed by the ruling monarch officially. Especially in France, so-called state nobles owed their privileges to their political service rather than by birth. Quite commonly all over Europe, they often stemmed from rich merchant families who regularly had to buy their titles from the monarch. As a result, state nobles served in the public administration, the army and church – or in greater numbers as attendants at court, highlighting the royal magnificence. Their rewards were tax exemption, titles and pension and a multitude of honours that came without cost. They were able to distinguish themselves by legal rights, their own dress-code and a way of life which was completely different from even wealthy non-nobles.

So-called commoners, on the other hand, included middle-class townspeople who paid most of the taxes required by frequent wars and extravagant royal courts. Peasant landholders usually owed fees and labour dues to local aristocrats. Hired labourers and vagabonds belonged to the poorest peasants, and in Eastern Europe, they were serfs. On overseas plantations, slavery provided a major labour force but in western Europe, this system was rather rare. Overall, absolute monarchies downgraded the status of women by tightening existing class distinctions.

Depiction of feudal society of the 15th century



© Mittelalterliches Ständebild, gemeinfrei

Adam Smith 1723–1790

Adam Smith, a key figure in moral philosophy and a founder of modern economics, introduced the concepts of the division of labour and the invisible hand in “The Wealth of Nations” (1776). He argued that individuals pursuing their own gain unintentionally contribute to the public good through market dynamics.

Though debated to this day, Smith’s ideas remain influential, especially among neo-liberals and monetarists, who value his scepticism of government intervention. His vision of a market-driven society with minimal state control became known as the laissez-faire or night-watchman state model.

Encyclopaedia Britannica

“The great figures of the Scottish Enlightenment never lost sight of the mission. Most were teachers or university professors; others were clergymen, who used their pulpits for the same purpose. [...] This attitude produced one great achievement that would live on long after the Scottish Enlightenment had all but departed from the scene. In fact, to this day most of us have it on our bookshelves or on our computer disks. We and our children use it almost daily. It is called the *Encyclopaedia Britannica*, the first volume of which appeared in Edinburgh in 1768. Its editors intended it to be a complete summary of scientific and human knowledge, incorporating the latest discoveries as part of a coherent and graspable whole. It worked.”

© Herman, Arthur: *The Scottish Enlightenment*. Clarendon Estate. London 2003. S. 67

M 13

The pros and cons of Brexit

Task

In groups of 4, sort the pro and con positions. Discuss the different viewpoints and agree on the ones you sympathise with most. Share your findings in a plenary session.

Remainers and leavers – sort the pro/con positions first

“Better together” in the EU protects against Trumpism.	Free trade among member states benefits Britain more than any tariffs.
British companies face no trade barriers when trading with other EU member states.	Britain can still have access to the European market without being bound by EU rules.
International banks are already thinking of leaving London because the consequences of Brexit would be unpredictable and bankers hate insecurity.	Adopting the Norwegian or Swiss models would require new negotiations with former EU partners who would not want to encourage more countries to leave.
British farmers might lose out on subsidies, jobs in international companies might be moved and millions of British workers could lose their jobs.	Membership in the EU allows EU citizens to move freely to GB and work there and vice versa. – Hundreds of British expats living in Spain and France might not have easy access to health services there anymore.
British identity would disappear; it's OK to spend holidays abroad but closer connections are not needed. Britain is an island after all.	London as a financial centre will retain its independence and global appeal and protect itself from trouble if the euro fails.
Most economists are sceptical about Brexit and believe that Britain would lose her influence and power, both economically as well as politically.	Euro-sceptics believe that Europe's principle of free movement means too much immigration into the country and insecurity, perhaps even terrorism.
The idea that GB could be completely autonomous and regain the “splendid isolation” it enjoyed when it still had its Empire sounds phony.	GB should get its sovereignty back since unelected officials in Brussels make rules that elected politicians like the local MP can do nothing about.
GB has always been a close ally of the USA and would continue to cultivate their special relationship.	Britain could follow Norway's example, which is not an EU member but does most of its trade with it.
The British could free themselves from restrictions imposed by Brussels and become economically more successful.	Smaller British companies do not trade with the EU and therefore would hardly be affected.

Klausurvorschlag: Jacobitism as a catalyst for change

M 15

Task

Based on your knowledge and the following material, write an essay titled “The Jacobite Movement as a precursor of the Scottish Enlightenment – an essay about twists in history and Wellsprings of Modernity”.

Follow the steps outlined below while writing your essay:

1. Delineate the factors that contribute to the “romanticising” the Jacobites rebellion.
2. Describe how Jacobitism “died many times”, or did it?
3. Discuss how the idea of Jacobitism as a turning point or catalyst could have played a role in British history. Provide examples of how Jacobitism and Enlightenment may have become intertwined.
4. Comment on Queen Victoria’s remark that she was “*a Jacobite at heart*” and explain in your conclusion whether this sentiment stole the Jacobite’s thunder.
5. Find a suitable conclusion for your essay.

Jacobites are romanticised

The early Enlightenment thinkers from Glasgow and Edinburgh are closely associated with Scottish philosophical and intellectual history: from David Hume (1711-1776) to Adam Smith (1723-1790). But only a few years after Hume's controversial work *A Treatise of Human Nature* (ca. 1739), the best counterproposal to the Scottish Enlightenment reached its climax and final end in the Scottish Highlands: the Jacobite Rebellion with its leader Charles Edward Stuart (1720-1788), the last pretender to the Stuart monarchy, who went down in Scottish history as Bonnie Prince Charlie, was crushed at the Battle of Culloden (1746) and chased out of the Highlands with his clansmen. A Scottish teenager, Flora MacDonald, helped him escape to the Isle of Skye and has since been celebrated in Scottish folklore as the heroine of the Jacobites in the Skye Boat Song. Charles Edward Stuart, also called the young pretender, Bonnie Prince Charlie (1720-1788), also called the young pretender. Bonnie Prince Charlie led a Highland army in Scotland to overthrow the English monarch and reinstall the rule of the Stuarts. In 1746, his army was defeated on the moor of Culloden. The Jacobite rebellion was an attempt to re-establish the traditional monarchy in Great Britain and completely anti-Enlightenment. Its doubtful hero has been romanticised as Bonnie Prince Charlie and survived in folklore and folksongs, very often serving as an anti-English icon in Scottish history. In this context, Scott's organisation of the Highland visit [to Edinburgh: August 1822] was a masterstroke and had a lasting effect on Scottish identity: “it precipitated change in the very idea of Scottishness. In order to accomplish this, Scott had to deal with the legacy of events of 1745.



Charles Edward Stuart, by William Mosman, public domain

Mehr Materialien für Ihren Unterricht mit RAAbits Online

Unterricht abwechslungsreicher, aktueller sowie nach Lehrplan gestalten – und dabei Zeit sparen.

Fertig ausgearbeitet für über 20 verschiedene Fächer, von der Grundschule bis zum Abitur: Mit RAAbits Online stehen redaktionell geprüfte, hochwertige Materialien zur Verfügung, die sofort einsetz- und editierbar sind.

- ✓ Zugriff auf bis zu **400 Unterrichtseinheiten** pro Fach
- ✓ Didaktisch-methodisch und **fachlich geprüfte Unterrichtseinheiten**
- ✓ Materialien als **PDF oder Word** herunterladen und individuell anpassen
- ✓ Interaktive und multimediale Lerneinheiten
- ✓ Fortlaufend **neues Material** zu aktuellen Themen



Testen Sie RAAbits Online
14 Tage lang kostenlos!

www.raabits.de

